



MATTHEW THARP
mtharp@fklaw.com
212.833.1167

April 5, 2024

VIA ECF

Hon. Paul A. Engelmayer
United States District Judge
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
40 Foley Square, Room 2201
New York, NY 10007

Re: *Maria Elena Swett Urquieta v. John Francis Bowe*,
1:24-cv-01379-PAE (S.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Engelmayer:

This firm represents Petitioner in the above-referenced action. We write pursuant to Paragraph 4.B.2 of Your Honor's Individual Rules and Practices in Civil Cases.

Pursuant to Paragraph 4.B.2, Petitioner respectfully seeks to redact certain portions of her Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, filed contemporaneously with this letter motion. While the redacted materials are "judicial documents" to which a presumption of public access applies, *see Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga*, 435 F.3d 110 (2d Cir. 2006); *Bernstein v. Bernstein Litowitz Berger & Grossman LLP*, 814 F.3d 132 (2d Cir. 2016), that presumption is to be balanced against countervailing factors, such as whether the documents "should remain confidential to safeguard . . . privacy" interests, *D.J.C.V. v. United States*, 2023 WL 3775283, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. June 2, 2023) (Engelmayer, J.) (granting sealing application); *see also United States v. Bannister*, 2023 WL 2596890, at *4 n.1 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 22, 2023) ("[S]ubject matter [that] is traditionally considered private rather than public' will weigh 'heavily against access.' . . . This includes certain 'financial records . . . , family affairs, illnesses, embarrassing conduct with no public ramifications, and similar matters.'") (Engelmayer, J.) (granting sealing application).

Redactions are particularly appropriate for filings that "relate to sensitive issues involving children as well as medical and mental health records." *LeClair v. Raymond*, 2021 WL 105768, at *9 (N.D.N.Y. Jan. 12, 2021) ("To the extent that the information contained therein is relevant and necessary to this decision, those facts are contained within the decision itself. There is no further need to disclose to the public this confidential information, and therefore the privacy interests of the individuals outweigh the public's right to view these documents."); *see also Dodona I, LLC v. Goldman, Sachs & Co.*, 119 F. Supp. 3d 152, 156 (S.D.N.Y. 2015) (allowing redaction of "sensitive personal information"); *Spring v. Allegany-Limestone Cent. Sch. Dist.*, 2021 WL 4166628, at *1 (W.D.N.Y. Sept. 14, 2021) (granting

The Honorable Paul A. Engelmayer

- 2 -

April 5, 2024

motion to seal student's medical records, IEP, and psychosocial evaluation); *J.L. on behalf of J.P. v. New York City Dep't of Educ.*, 2024 WL 291218, at *3 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 25, 2024) ("I find that the children's privacy interests in their identities and their specific medical and educational information outweighs the public interest in this information.").

Here, the portions of the Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law that Petitioner seeks to redact relate to S.B.S., a young child who is a non-party to this proceeding. Moreover, many if not all of the portions of the Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law that Petitioner seeks to redact implicate S.B.S.' privacy interests, including but not limited to S.B.S.'s privacy interest in his own medical records. Much of the material that Petitioner seeks to redact also quotes from documents that were designed "Confidential" when produced by Petitioner and Respondent. Accordingly, redaction of this confidential and sensitive information regarding a non-party child is appropriate here. *See, e.g., D.J.C.V.*, 2023 WL 3775283, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. June 2, 2023); *Bannister*, 2023 WL 2596890, at *4 n.1; *LeClair*, 2021 WL 105768, at *9; *Dodona I*, 119 F. Supp. 3d at 156; *Spring*, 2021 WL 4166628, at *1; *New York City Dep't of Educ.*, 2024 WL 291218, at *3.

Counsel for Respondent has stated they join in this application. We are available at the Court's convenience to discuss this application.

Respectfully submitted,

GRANTED.

/s Matthew Tharp

SO ORDERED.

Matthew Tharp



PAUL A. ENGELMAYER
United States District Judge
April 9, 2024